



Appendix F

Tallaght to City
Centre Section:
Section 3 -
Crumlin to
Grand Canal
Route Options
Assessment
MCA Tables

A3 Crumlin Road Options Assessment

Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Route Option CG1b (Crumlin Road – Bus Lanes in Each Direction)	Route Option CG1c (Crumlin Road – Partial Bus Lanes in Each Direction)	Route Option CG1d (Crumlin Road – Partial Bus Lanes in Each Direction Alternative)	Route Option CG1e (Crumlin Road – Partial Bus Lanes and cycle lanes along Clogher Road)	
Economy (Cost Assessment and Transport Economic Indicators)	Capital Cost	<p>Total Capital Cost €8.3m Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost (€5.6m)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Road widening on Crumlin Road and associated works (drainage, services etc.) to facilitate bus lanes in each direction - Boundary works to impacted properties - Modify Crumlin Road/Kildare Road junction to facilitate widened carriageway - Modify Sundrive Road/Crumlin Road junction to facilitate widened carriageway - Modify Cooley Road/Crumlin Road junction to facilitate widened carriageway - Provision of improved pedestrian facilities along route - Provide raised adjacent cycle facilities along Kildare Road <p>Land Acquisition Cost (€2.7m) 1,790 sqm Private Land 2,800 sqm Public Land 102 Properties affected</p>	<p>Total Capital Cost €3.8m Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost (€3.3m)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Minor local widening / kerb realignment works at some locations along Crumlin Road to facilitate an additional lane - Upgrade Crumlin Road/Bangor Drive junction to traffic signals - Minor upgrades to Sundrive Road/Crumlin Road junction - Minor upgrades to Kildare Road/Crumlin Road junction - Minor upgrades to Cooley Road/Crumlin Road junction - Provide raised adjacent cycle facilities along Kildare Road <p>Land Acquisition Cost (€0.5m) 330 sqm Private Land 1,300 sqm Public Land 27 Properties affected</p>	<p>Total Capital Cost €6.9m Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost (€5.3m)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Road widening along Crumlin Road between Crumlin Shopping Centre and Windmill Road - Road widening along Crumlin Road between Lissadel Road and Cooley Road - Minor local widening / kerb realignment works between Lissadel Road and Windmill Road - Minor upgrades to Sundrive Road/Crumlin Road junction - Upgrade Crumlin Road/Windmill Road junction to traffic signals - Minor upgrades to Kildare Road/Crumlin Road junction - Minor upgrades to Cooley Road/Crumlin Road junction - Provide raised adjacent cycle facilities along Kildare Road <p>Land Acquisition Cost (€1.7m) 1,120 sqm Private Land 1,300 sqm Public Land 60 Properties affected</p>	<p>Total Capital Cost €4.5m Indicative Scheme Infrastructure Works Cost (€4.0m)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Road widening adjacent to Rafter's Road, Iveagh Grounds, and EHB. - Minor local widening / kerb realignment works at some locations along Crumlin Road to facilitate an additional lane - Road Closures of Clonard Road and Bangor Drive - Upgrades to Sundrive Road/Crumlin Road junction - Provide raised adjacent cycle facilities along Kildare Road and Clogher Road <p>Land Acquisition Cost (€0.5m) 346 sqm Private Land 380 sqm Public Land 10 Properties affected</p>	
	<i>Rank</i>					
	Transport Reliability and Quality of Service		Journey Time: 3 - 4 mins Length: 1.4 km No. of Junctions: 3	Journey Time: 4 - 5 mins Length: 1.4 km No. of Junctions: 4	Journey Time: 4 - 5 mins Length: 1.4 km No. of Junctions: 3	Journey Time: 4 - 5 mins Length: 1.4 km No. of Junctions: 5

		Bus lanes are provided along approximately 100% of this route option.	Bus lanes are provided along approximately 50% of this route option. A single bus lane along the road would be provided, which would provide priority along approximately half of the route in each direction. Traffic signal priority measures could be utilised to minimise delays to buses along the sections of the route without bus lanes and maintain journey time and timetable reliability	Bus lanes are provided along approximately 85% of this route option.	Bus lanes are provided along approximately 80% of this route option.
	<i>Rank</i>				
Integration	Land Use Integration	This route serves an area which is largely developed, with limited scope for further development. As the surrounding area is high density, the route provides good integration with land use.	This route serves an area which is largely developed, with limited scope for further development. As the surrounding area is high density, the route provides good integration with land use.	This route serves an area which is largely developed, with limited scope for further development. As the surrounding area is high density, the route provides good integration with land use.	This route serves an area which is largely developed, with limited scope for further development. As the surrounding area is high density, the route provides good integration with land use.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Residential Population and Employment Catchments	Residential Population Catchments - 5 minute walk catchment of approximately 3,000 - 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 11,400 - 15 minute walk catchment of approximately 27,700 Employment catchments 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 6,300	Residential Population Catchments - 5 minute walk catchment of approximately 3,000 - 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 11,400 - 15 minute walk catchment of approximately 27,700 Employment catchments 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 6,300	Residential Population Catchments - 5 minute walk catchment of approximately 3,000 - 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 11,400 - 15 minute walk catchment of approximately 27,700 Employment catchments 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 6,300	Residential Population Catchments - 5 minute walk catchment of approximately 3,000 - 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 11,400 - 15 minute walk catchment of approximately 27,700 Employment catchments 10 minute walk catchment of approximately 6,300
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Transport Network Integration	This route coincides with portions of existing bus routes 27, 54a, 65, 75 and 77a. There is no potential for interchange with orbital bus routes or other public transport modes. There would be no impact on general traffic.	This route coincides with portions of existing bus routes 27, 54a, 65, 75 and 77a. There is no potential for interchange with orbital bus routes or other public transport modes. There would be a minor impact on general traffic as a result of this option due to the proposed use of queue	This route coincides with portions of existing bus routes 27, 54a, 65, 75 and 77a. There is no potential for interchange with orbital bus routes or other public transport modes. There would be a minor impact on general traffic as a result of this option due to the proposed use of queue	This route coincides with portions of existing bus routes 27, 54a, 65, 75 and 77a. There is no potential for interchange with orbital bus routes or other public transport modes. There would be a minor impact on general traffic as a result of this option due to the proposed use of queue relocation which may result in

			relocation which may result in additional delays to traffic. Furthermore, a number of turn bans are proposed to minimise the amount of traffic entering the area being managed by queue relocation signals.	relocation which may result in additional delays to traffic. Furthermore, a number of turn bans are proposed to minimise the amount of traffic entering the area being managed by queue relocation signals.	additional delays to traffic. Furthermore, a number of road closures are proposed to minimise the amount of traffic entering the area being managed by queue relocation signals.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Cycling Integration	This route option is identified in the GDA Cycle Network Plan as forming part of primary cycle route 8, and secondary cycle route 8A. For this route option, no dedicated cycle facilities would be provided along Crumlin Road. Primary route 8 would be rerouted to Kildare Road and Sundrive Road and delivered as part of this scheme. Raised adjacent cycle facilities would be provided along Kildare Road and Sundrive Road.	This route option is identified in the GDA Cycle Network Plan as forming part of primary cycle route 8, and secondary cycle route 8A. For this route option, no dedicated cycle facilities would be provided along Crumlin Road. Primary route 8 would be rerouted to Kildare Road and Sundrive Road and delivered as part of this scheme. Raised adjacent cycle facilities would be provided along Kildare Road and Sundrive Road.	This route option is identified in the GDA Cycle Network Plan as forming part of primary cycle route 8, and secondary cycle route 8A. For this route option, no dedicated cycle facilities would be provided along Crumlin Road. Primary route 8 would be rerouted to Kildare Road and Sundrive Road and delivered as part of this scheme. Raised adjacent cycle facilities would be provided along Kildare Road and Sundrive Road.	This route option is identified in the GDA Cycle Network Plan as forming part of primary cycle route 8, and secondary cycle route 8A. For this route option, no dedicated cycle facilities would be provided along Crumlin Road. Primary route 8 would be rerouted to Kildare Road and Clogher Road and delivered as part of this scheme. Raised adjacent cycle facilities would be provided along Kildare Road and Clogher Road.
	<i>Rank</i>				
Accessibility & Social Inclusion	Key Trip Attractors	<p>Hospital</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Hospital Retail - Old County Road - Crumlin Road <p>Leisure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Bowling Club - The Star, Crumlin - St. James' Gate FC <p>Education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Loreto College - Crumlin College of Further Education 	<p>Hospital</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Hospital Retail - Old County Road - Crumlin Road <p>Leisure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Bowling Club - The Star, Crumlin - St. James' Gate FC <p>Education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Loreto College - Crumlin College of Further Education 	<p>Hospital</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Hospital Retail - Old County Road - Crumlin Road <p>Leisure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Bowling Club - The Star, Crumlin - St. James' Gate FC <p>Education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Loreto College - Crumlin College of Further Education 	<p>Hospital</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Hospital Retail - Old County Road - Crumlin Road <p>Leisure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Crumlin Bowling Club - The Star, Crumlin - St. James' Gate FC <p>Education</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Loreto College - Crumlin College of Further Education
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Deprived Geographic Areas	The route serves a number of areas in the Dublin South West Inner City RAPID area. In terms of the HP Deprivation Index, the route serves areas ranging from disadvantaged to marginally above average.	The route serves a number of areas in the Dublin South West Inner City RAPID area. In terms of the HP Deprivation Index, the route serves areas ranging from disadvantaged to marginally above average.	The route serves a number of areas in the Dublin South West Inner City RAPID area. In terms of the HP Deprivation Index, the route serves areas ranging from disadvantaged to marginally above average.	The route serves a number of areas in the Dublin South West Inner City RAPID area. In terms of the HP Deprivation Index, the route serves areas ranging from disadvantaged to marginally above average.

	<i>Rank</i>				
Safety	Road and Pedestrian Safety	No. of Junction: 4 No turn movements required in either direction.	No. of Junction: 5 No turn movements required in either direction.	No. of Junction: 5 No turn movements required in either direction.	No. of Junction: 4 No turn movements required in either direction.
	<i>Rank</i>				
Environment	Archaeology and Cultural Heritage	No Recorded Monuments or sites of archaeological and cultural heritage merit were identified along the route or within the vicinity of the route.	No Recorded Monuments or sites of archaeological and cultural heritage merit were identified along the route or within the vicinity of the route.	No Recorded Monuments or sites of archaeological and cultural heritage merit were identified along the route or within the vicinity of the route.	No Recorded Monuments or sites of archaeological and cultural heritage merit were identified along the route or within the vicinity of the route.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Architectural Heritage	There are no Protected Structures along the route. There are 40 sites recorded on the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage. In total 34 of these are located on the northern side of Crumlin Road and include a number of residences associated with the Iveagh Gardens estate, Ardscoil Éanna and Sundrive Garda Station. The remaining 6 sites are located along the southern side of Crumlin Road and include the Epilepsy Ireland building, AIB building, Crumlin Health Centre (3 No.) and Loreto School. The proposed route may require land-take from the recorded buildings along the southern side of Crumlin Road (approx. 1m) and as such would have a negative impact on these buildings.	There are no Protected Structures along the route. There are 40 sites listed on the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage. In total 34 of these are located on the northern side of Crumlin Road and include a number of residences associated with the Iveagh Gardens estate, Ardscoil Éanna and Sundrive Garda Station. The remaining 6 sites are located along the southern side of Crumlin Road and include the Epilepsy Ireland building, AIB building, Crumlin Health Centre (3 No.) and Loreto School. However, as no widening is required for this option it is not considered that there will be an impact to these heritage features.	There are no Protected Structures along the route. There are 40 sites recorded on the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage. In total 34 of these are located on the northern side of Crumlin Road and include a number of residences associated with the Iveagh Gardens estate, Ardscoil Éanna and Sundrive Garda Station. The remaining 6 sites are located along the southern side of Crumlin Road and include the Epilepsy Ireland building, AIB building, Crumlin Health Centre (3 No.) and Loreto School. Road widening to the north of Crumlin Road between Lissadel Road and Cooley Road has the potential to negatively impact on the grounds of Ardscoil Éanna. Land-take to the south of Crumlin Road between the Shopping Centre and Clonard Road has the potential to negatively impact on the grounds of Crumlin Health Centre.	There are no Protected Structures along the route. There are 40 sites listed on the National Inventory of Architectural Heritage. In total 34 of these are located on the northern side of Crumlin Road and include a number of residences associated with the Iveagh Gardens estate, Ardscoil Éanna and Sundrive Garda Station. The remaining 6 sites are located along the southern side of Crumlin Road and include the Epilepsy Ireland building, AIB building, Crumlin Health Centre (3 No.) and Loreto School. However, limited widening is required for this option it is therefore considered that impacts will be minimised. were identified along the route or within the vicinity of the route.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Flora and Fauna	The route does not cross any site of International, European or	The route does not cross any site of International, European	The route does not cross any site of International, European	The route does not cross any site of International, European or

		National conservation value. The route does not traverse any streams or rivers. There are no trees along Crumlin Road. There are intermittent trees along Kildare Road and Sundrive Road that are unlikely to be of ecological value given their distances from each other.	or National conservation value. The route does not traverse any streams or rivers. There are no trees along Crumlin Road. There are intermittent trees along Kildare Road and Sundrive Road that are unlikely to be of ecological value given their distances from each other.	or National conservation value. The route does not traverse any streams or rivers. There are no trees along Crumlin Road. There are intermittent trees along Kildare Road and Sundrive Road that are unlikely to be of ecological value given their distances from each other.	National conservation value. The route does not traverse any streams or rivers. There are no trees along Crumlin Road. There are intermittent trees along Kildare Road and Clogher Road which will be unaffected by this proposal.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Soils and Geology	Minimal potential for impacts to soils and geology and no evidence of historic industries or gravel pits that could give rise to potential contamination.	Minimal potential for impacts to soils and geology and no evidence of historic industries or gravel pits that could give rise to potential contamination.	Minimal potential for impacts to soils and geology and no evidence of historic industries or gravel pits that could give rise to potential contamination.	Minimal potential for impacts to soils and geology and no evidence of historic industries or gravel pits that could give rise to potential contamination.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Hydrology	This route does not cross or run adjacent to any rivers or streams so diversion works or construction of bridges or culverts is not required.	This route does not cross or run adjacent to any rivers or streams so diversion works or construction of bridges or culverts is not required.	This route does not cross or run adjacent to any rivers or streams so diversion works or construction of bridges or culverts is not required.	This route does not cross or run adjacent to any rivers or streams so diversion works or construction of bridges or culverts is not required.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Landscape and Visual	Makes use of existing road corridors. Increase from 2 to 4 lanes. There would be some loss of amenity space at the Guinness sports facility. The proposed route would require land-take from some of the sensitive buildings (approx. 1m) and as such would potentially have a small negative impact on these buildings.	Makes use of existing road corridors. Loss of approximately 50 trees to accommodate raised adjacent cycle lanes on Kildare Road and Sundrive Road. There would be no loss of amenity space at the Guinness sports facility.	Makes use of existing road corridors. Loss of approximately 50 trees to accommodate raised adjacent cycle lanes on Kildare Road and Sundrive Road. There would be some loss of amenity space at the Guinness sports facility.	Makes use of existing road corridors. There would be some loss of amenity space at the Guinness sports facility. Pocket parks to be created at the ends of Clogher Road and Bangor Drive. No trees are to be removed on alternative cycle route.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Air Quality	Traffic would be closer to a number of residential sensitive receptors along Crumlin Road due to road widening. This may result in an increase in pollutant concentrations at these receptors.	All proposed works would remain within the existing road corridor therefore it is not considered that air quality would change.	Traffic would be closer to some residential sensitive receptors along Crumlin Road due to road widening. This may result in an increase in pollutant concentrations at these receptors.	Most of the proposed works would remain within the existing road corridor therefore it is not considered that air quality would change significantly.
	<i>Rank</i>				

	Noise & Vibration	Traffic would be closer to a number of residential sensitive receptors along Crumlin Road due to road widening. This may result in an increase in noise and vibrations at these receptors.	All proposed works would remain within the existing road corridor therefore it is not considered that noise levels would change.	Traffic would be closer to some residential sensitive receptors along Crumlin Road due to road widening. This may result in an increase in noise and vibrations at these receptors.	Most of the proposed works would remain within the existing road corridor therefore it is not considered that noise levels would change significantly.
	<i>Rank</i>				
	Land Use Character	Route has a substantial impact on existing land use. Loss of large part of front gardens for 75 property owners along Crumlin Road. In addition there is a loss of large part of front gardens for 27 property owners along Clogher Road to facilitate raised adjacent cycle lanes. Informal on-footpath and on-street parking spaces would be removed (approximately 150 spaces), footpath width would be reduced, and trees (approximately 50 no.) would be removed resulting in a change to the Kildare Road character and potentially impacting on its use.	Route has a substantial impact on existing land use. Loss of large part of front gardens for 27 property owners along Clogher Road to facilitate raised adjacent cycle lanes. Informal on-footpath and onstreet parking spaces would be removed (approximately 150 spaces), footpath width would be reduced, and trees (approximately 50 no.) would be removed resulting in a change to the Kildare Road character and potentially impacting on its use.	Route has a substantial impact on existing land use. Loss of large part of front gardens for 33 property owners along Crumlin Road to facilitate bus lanes and for 27 property owners along Clogher Road to facilitate raised adjacent cycle lanes. Informal on-footpath and on-street parking spaces would be removed (approximately 150 spaces), footpath width would be reduced, and trees (approximately 50 no.) would be removed resulting in a change to the Kildare Road character and potentially impacting on its use.	Route has an impact on existing land use where widening is taking place, although this is relatively minor on Crumlin Road. On Kildare Road and Clogher Road, it is proposed to work within the existing carriageway, retaining trees and parking where possible, therefore the land use character will remain as is.
	<i>Rank</i>				